



THE UNIVERSITY *of* EDINBURGH

Edinburgh Research Explorer

Eighteenth-Century Scots Song

Citation for published version:

Campbell, K 2013, 'Eighteenth-Century Scots Song: Stephen Clarke, a Reluctant Pioneer', *Review of Scottish Culture*, vol. 25, pp. 73-96.

Link:

[Link to publication record in Edinburgh Research Explorer](#)

Document Version:

Early version, also known as pre-print

Published In:

Review of Scottish Culture

Publisher Rights Statement:

© Campbell, K. (2013). Eighteenth-Century Scots Song: Stephen Clarke, a Reluctant Pioneer. Review of Scottish Culture, 25, 73-96.

General rights

Copyright for the publications made accessible via the Edinburgh Research Explorer is retained by the author(s) and / or other copyright owners and it is a condition of accessing these publications that users recognise and abide by the legal requirements associated with these rights.

Take down policy

The University of Edinburgh has made every reasonable effort to ensure that Edinburgh Research Explorer content complies with UK legislation. If you believe that the public display of this file breaches copyright please contact openaccess@ed.ac.uk providing details, and we will remove access to the work immediately and investigate your claim.



Eighteenth-Century Scots Song: Stephen Clarke, a Reluctant Pioneer

Katherine Campbell

Introduction

The largest repository of Scots song in the eighteenth century is the six-volume collection called the *Scots Musical Museum* (1787-1803),¹ published by the Edinburgh music engraver and seller, James Johnson (c.1750-1811).² In this venture, Johnson found an energetic and enthusiastic collaborator in Robert Burns (1759-96). Burns fulfilled role of editor, collecting and selecting old songs, composing new ones, and amending bawdy songs so that they could be sung in polite society.³ He also worked closely throughout with the *Museum's* musical adviser, Stephen Clarke.⁴

Clarke has typically been portrayed in a rather negative light.⁵ The only surviving letter from the correspondence between Clarke and Burns, which is often quoted, shows Burns begging Clarke to write him a line to say whether or not he is willing to take up the post as music tutor that Burns has arranged for him.⁶ Clarke was certainly being a lazy correspondent here, and he was often accused of indolence by his friends.⁷ They also spoke warmly of him, however, and he was clearly a boon companion as well as someone whom they respected for his musicianship.⁸ He simply needed a push in order to be productive in the way that his friends wanted him to be. When he did become absorbed, he worked with skill and sensitivity.

The accompaniments that Clarke provided for the songs in the *Museum* made some use of figured bass (a system of indicating chords through the use of numbers). This practice, however, was going out of fashion in the late eighteenth century and was soon to be discontinued altogether.⁹ Its declining popularity is reflected across the six volumes of the *Museum*: it is most prevalent in the first volume; it is less common in volume two; by volume three, it is present in only sixteen songs; four instances are found in volume four; and volume five includes only two instances.¹⁰ In volume one of *A Select Collection of Original Scottish Airs* (1793), in which the music was written out in full, George Thomson gave a very practical reason for the decline in the use of figured bass: 'Instead of a Thorough-bass denoted by figures, which very few can play with any propriety, the harmony is plainly expressed in musical Notes, which every young Lady may execute correctly'.¹¹ Indeed, the improvisatory element found in the *Museum* accompaniments became replaced by more

prescribed accompaniments in the nineteenth century, which had the drawing-room performer and audience in mind.

This article offers a reappraisal of aspects of Clarke's work and highlights his role in modifying instrumental melodies for voice and in undertaking musical transcription. Firstly, it will give some biographical information about Clarke, focusing on his musical connections in Edinburgh, since this has not hitherto been given a detailed treatment. Secondly, it will examine his role in transforming instrumental tunes for voice. Thirdly, it will consider an account of Clarke collecting material from tradition, highlighting his role in this regard.

Clarke in Edinburgh musical society

Stephen Clarke was born in Durham *c.*1744.¹² As an Englishman, it is perhaps surprising that he should have been chosen as the musical editor of the *Scots Musical Museum*, the great collection of Scotland's 'national' music. Indeed, one of the principles of the *Museum* was that songs in English 'if by Scotchmen' were allowed, but the 'Music must be all Scotch'.¹³ Clarke – an organist and harpsichordist – was steeped in the classical tradition, and if he had any background in folk music at all, it would have been from the English rather than the Scottish side. He was, however, an expert musician, and he came to play a major role in the Edinburgh musical scene of the time. These factors, coupled with this versatility, meant that he was an ideal collaborator for the *Museum*.

Clarke arrived in Edinburgh *c.*1764.¹⁴ Shortly afterwards, in September 1765, he married Henretta [*sic*] Duff (daughter of John Duff, a land surveyor at Dundee). The marriage record describes him as the organist in 'College Kirk parish', and he had presumably relocated to the capital to fulfil this role.¹⁵

In October 1769 Clarke joined the Cape Club, which acted as a meeting point for writers, painters, musicians and singers. The song collector David Herd (Sir Scrape) was heavily associated with the Club,¹⁶ as was the poet Robert Fergusson,¹⁷ and Herd wrote of it as follows in a preface to its sederunt book:¹⁸

The Knights Companions of the Cape began to call themselves by that name about the year 1764. The original constituents of the order occasionally admitted by a prescribed form such other members as they found agreeable. The purpose and intention of the Society from the beginning was: after the business of the day was over to pass the evening socially with a set of select companions in an agreeable but at the same time a rational and frugal manner; for this purpose beer or porter were their liquors, from

fourpence to sixpence each the extent of their usual expence, conversation and a song their amusement, gaming generally prohibited, and a freedom for each to come and depart at their pleasure was always considered as essentiall to the constitution of the Society.¹⁹

The Club had a convivial nature and song was central to its proceedings. Members typically had their own club nicknames, and McElroy identifies these in the case of the following musicians: James Balfour (Sir Tumult), John Smeaton (Sir Stair), Ferdinand Arrigoni (Sir Claret), Cornforth Gilson (Sir Sobersides), and Johann Schetky (Sir Handle).²⁰ While this atmosphere would have no doubt been attractive to Clarke, his independence of spirit and unwillingness to fit in with the expectations of others meant that his time with the Club was relatively short-lived. The sederunt book shows that he became a member on 25 October 1769, but the entry was subsequently scored out with 'Expelled' written after it. The scoring out of his name has unfortunately made his nickname, found on the same line, illegible.²¹ The circumstances are explained in the meeting of the 'Eleventh Grand Cape', held on 9 February 1771:

That such persons upon the roll of the Cape who reside in and about Edinburgh and have constant opportunities, but have never complied with the regulations of the Society in Signing the Laws and taking out diplomas shall from and after the date of this meeting be struck off from the said roll of the Knights. Therefore the following persons who have never complied with these regulations tho' repeatedly required by written intimation from the Recorder so to do ... [list of names including 'Stephen Clark'] are ordained to be, and are hereby Expelled and Extruded [from] this Society in all time coming having forfeited all manner of title they ever could pretend to be members thereof by their not complying with the Laws and taking out Diplomas as aforesaid.²²

Late eighteenth-century Edinburgh was a hotbed of musical activity,²³ and Clarke can be placed in relation to one of the groups concerned in it: the Edinburgh Musical Society.²⁴ Correspondence between Gilbert Innes of Stow (1751-1832) and Thomas Ebdon (1738-1811) in January 1790 about its concerts makes mention of Clarke, and shows that he continued to maintain contact with his colleagues south of the border, despite having lived in Edinburgh at this point for some twenty-five years. Ebdon, from Durham originally, was the organist and

master of the choir at Durham Cathedral; he composed items for the choir and for harpsichord performance.²⁵ The letters concern arrangements for forthcoming performances in Edinburgh by the Durham Cathedral choir. In one of them, Clarke's expertise is alluded to:

Our chorus singers are very bad, but our instrumental Performers will execute their part properly and your acquaintance Mr. Clark is Organist, the organ is tolerable if equal to the room. ... The Vestry of our English Chappel have also agreed to give ten guineas of addition to the sum above mentioned on your gentlemen performing in the Chappel on Sunday the 14 February. Mr Clark is Organist there and the organ is Capital.²⁶

Ebdon responded on 18 January 1790 as follows:

May I beg the favour of you to make my Comp[liments] to Mr Clark, and desire to know what is expected to be performed at the Chapel, whether at Morning or Evening Service, or at both. I shall put Instrumental Parts to some sacred Music for the concerts, our [?] Evening Service ... and single songs.²⁷

Although an able musician, Clarke's dedication was sometimes found wanting. Colonel Godfrey Burgess Winn (d. 1981), who had a particular interest in organ music in Scotland,²⁸ detailed his activities in connection with the Edinburgh Musical Society as follows:

Clarke was appointed 'resident' organist and harpsichordist at St Cecilia's Hall in July 1769, from which date until 1780, the accounts of the Musical Society of Edinburgh show that he was in receipt of a salary of £10. During the year 1774-5 he was paid the sum of £7.3.9d for 'writing Samson (Handel.' [sic] One of his 'standing' duties at concerts was to play an organ concerto once a month. This he not only failed to do, but frequently absented himself from the concerts altogether. At a meeting of the Directors of the Society on Feb. 14th, 1777, disappointment was expressed in the laxity displayed by Mr Stephen Clark and a Mr Shunniman in playing an organ solo. It was resolved that they be dismissed, but later, on having received an apology from Clarke, the Directors recanted and re-instated the two musicians.²⁹

When Clarke was first in Edinburgh, St Paul's Episcopal Chapel, at which he was the organist, was in Blackfriars Wynd, but in 1774 the congregation moved to the newly built

Cowgate Chapel (Fig. 1),³⁰ and it was here that Clarke played the organ from that time onwards.³¹ This chapel, which was at the intersection of St Mary's Street and the Cowgate, later became St Patrick's Roman Catholic Church,³² the Episcopal congregation having moved to the newly built St Paul's Church in York Place in 1818.³³

Payments are recorded to Clarke in the minute book of St Paul's beginning in 1779. The stipend from Martinmas 1778 to Martinmas 1779 was £30, with this figure increasing to £30 and six pence in 1783-4, then to £30 and eight pence from 1784-5. The last payment recorded in the minute book is at Martinmas 1791,³⁴ although this probably simply represents a gap in the record keeping, since it is known that Clarke carried on as organist at St Paul's until his death in 1797, whereupon the role passed to his son, William. This father-son 'dynasty', which covered some sixty years, is particularly noteworthy.³⁵ William also took over his father's work on the *Museum*, and was the musical editor of the final volume.

As well as drawing income from his position at St Paul's and from the Edinburgh Musical Society, Clarke received payment as a music tutor to the Gordon family. Figure 2 shows an invoice dated 3 November to His Grace the Duke of Gordon for £20.2s for Clarke's services, the first of which is dated December 1786, but probably dates back to October since it is for three months of 'tickets for teaching music', the individual lessons evidently being paid for in this way. The payment of this amount to Clarke is then recorded in the 'State of Cash Debursed by Dowager Lady Maxwell, on acct. of the Duke of Gordon Young Ladies Governess and Servant, presently residing in her Ladyships family', dated 12 November 1787.³⁶ The family residence was in Hyndford Close off the High Street.

The Dowager Lady Maxwell was the mother of Jane Maxwell, the duchess of Gordon (Fig. 3), and the grandmother of the 'Young Ladies'. Alexander, the fourth duke of Gordon, and Jane, his first wife, had five daughters: Charlotte, Madeline, Susan, Louisa and Georgiana. At the time of the invoice, they were aged about 19, 17, 15, 13, and 6, respectively,³⁷ and so were all of an age to be receiving music tuition, with the exception perhaps of the youngest.³⁸

Interestingly, Clarke's role in the Gordon household gave him a (previously unrecognised) link with Robert Burns, who on his arrival in Edinburgh in December 1786 wrote to his friends that the duchess was a patroness of his.³⁹ Burns first mentioned Clarke in a letter of October 1787 to the Reverend John Skinner of Longside concerning the *Museum*:

There is a work going on in Edinburgh, just now, which claims your best assistance.
An Engraver [James Johnson] in this town has set about collecting and publishing all

the Scotch Songs, with the Music, that can found. ... Drs Beattie and Blacklock are lending a hand, and the first musician in town presides over that department. I have been absolutely crazed about it, collecting old stanzas, and every information remaining, respecting their origin, authors, &c. ⁴⁰

In 1787, Clarke was aged about 43, Johnson about 37, and Burns 28, and the trio worked together on the preparation of the *Museum* up to the time of Burns' death. All three moved in Masonic circles,⁴¹ which valued music and song,⁴² and a portrait of Clarke appears in the painting *The Inauguration of Robert Burns as Poet Laureate of Lodge Canongate Kilwinning, No. 2, 1st March 1787* by William Stewart Watson.⁴³ The companion book to this painting, *A Winter with Robert Burns* by John Marshall,⁴⁴ identified the individuals present, Clarke being part of what Marshall termed the 'Musicians' Group'. Although 'the ceremony depicted in the painting almost certainly never took place',⁴⁵ Watson went to considerable efforts to obtain pictures or prints of the individuals he represented,⁴⁶ and so his representation of Clarke is probably an authentic likeness. Clarke is shown in Figure 4 along with his fellow editors.

The close working relationship among the three is expressed in a letter from Burns to Johnson at Bell's Wynd in Edinburgh dated 19 June 1789:

Mr Clarke & I have frequent meetings & consultations on your work. – I have given him three or four songs which he is preparing for you. – One is, the Caledonian Hunt, as it seems the verses I sent you don't suit it; another is, The Braes o' Ballochmyle, to which I have likewise given him new words, & a third is, The Poor Thresher.⁴⁷

A letter of October 1793 shows Burns working together with Clarke in Dumfries and keeping Johnson in touch with their progress:

Why did you not send me those tunes & verses that Clarke & you cannot make out? – Let me have them as soon as possible, that, while he is at hand, I may settle the matter with him. – He & I have been very busy providing & laying out material for your fifth volume. – I have got about a dozen by me.⁴⁸

A letter from Johnson to Burns of around May/June 1794 shows the close three-way collaboration continuing, with Clarke now in direct contact with Johnson in Edinburgh:

My very dear friend,

... [I] am ashamed I did not write to you sooner concerning what you requested anent the Songs Mr Urbani had taken, but I deferred till I could inform you that the fifth Volume was actually [*sic*] begun, which is now the case. Mr Clarke has given me some to begin with and he is busie with more; he has promised to hold me agoing. Please accept my warmest thanks for all your kind favours and wishes. I could have it in my power, but to serve you, this fresh supply has added new life to me as I am trembling for fear lest we should not make up the Number.⁴⁹

Adapting instrumental tunes for voice

Stephen Clarke drew on printed music collections for some of the tunes in the *Museum*. It has been thought by music scholars that the changes he made to them were minimal,⁵⁰ but this section will show that considerable conscious effort went into the adaptation of instrumental tunes for voice, sometimes following the advice of Burns. Clarke can be regarded as a mediator in this regard, bridging the gap between instrumental and vocal performance.

The eighteenth century saw an explosion in the publication of fiddle music in Scotland and it is often referred to as the ‘Golden Age’ of the instrument. There was a proliferation of tune composition with many new pieces being written, much of it presenting challenges to fiddle players. Burns made use of some of the newly composed material. The *Museum*, then, contains several different types of Burns song in terms of the musical component: there are adaptations of traditional songs which use their traditional tunes, new lyrics written for traditional song melodies, and new lyrics written for fiddle tunes.⁵¹ Clarke had to be able to work with all of these distinctive types.

A particularly important source was *The Caledonian Pocket Companion*, the work of the Fife musician James Oswald (1710-69). The work extends to 550 tunes and was published c.1745-c.1760. It contains Scottish, Irish and English material as well as Oswald’s own compositions and his variations to many of the traditional tunes.⁵² Burns owned a copy of the *Companion*, and the excitement he felt at this is conveyed in a letter of 1791 to James Johnson:

I was so lucky lately as to pick an entire copy of Oswald’s Scots Music, & I think I shall make glorious work out of it. – I want much Anderson’s Collection of strathspeys &c. and then I think I will have all the Music of the country.⁵³

Burns is referring here to John Anderson's *Collection of New Highland Strathspey Reels for the Violin or German Flute* (c.1795).⁵⁴ Burns' copy of the *Companion* with his own notes is extant.⁵⁵

I shall take as a sample five songs through which I can illustrate the movement from instrumental to song tradition. The first song shows the adoption of an instrumental tune from tradition that had appeared in the *Companion*. Three newly composed songs are then considered. The last song concerns a strathspey which was well known in tradition but which presented particular issues for Burns and Clarke. Through these examples, the typical techniques that were required to translate successfully from one genre to another will be addressed.

Song no. 190 in the *Museum*, 'To a Blackbird', uses the tune 'Scots Queen' from the *Companion*.⁵⁶ The *Companion* marks the tempo as 'slow' and this marking has been carried across to the *Museum* (Tunes 1a and 1b). The original tune is in G minor, but this has been lowered in the *Museum* to E minor, presumably to make it more suitable for voice. The first four bars of the *Companion* tune are repeated (by means of a repeat sign at the end of the four bars), and this is also the case in the *Museum*, though the bars are written out in full to show the vocal line. A further ten bars are then drawn from the original, but these are not repeated in the *Museum* as they are in the *Companion* version. The original tune then continues with a variation of the original four bars (repeated), followed by a variation of the aforementioned ten bars (also repeated). Neither of these variations is included in the *Museum*. Another difference is that the indications 'soft' and 'strong' are given in the *Companion* at what would equate to bars 12 and 14 in the *Museum*: this is to signify two phrases, each of two bars, which are similar and thus a dynamic contrast is to be made between them. This device does not appear in the *Museum*, no doubt because such dynamic changes would make less sense in the context of the song lyric. Altogether then, the *Museum* version is somewhat shorter: the tune has been used to fit the lyric, and not the other way around. The notes and rhythm of the tune (excepting the points where the two tunes diverge overall), however, have been carried across to the *Museum* in an identical fashion, albeit in a different key.

One of Oswald's own compositions, the 'Scots Recluse',⁵⁷ was used for 'When I upon thy Bosom Lean' (*Museum*, no. 205) (Tune 2). This melody is marked as 'Slow' in both publications. Its key (C major) differs from that of the *Companion* (D major), and has the effect of lowering the top note for the voice to G above the stave rather than A. Clarke has preserved the ornamentation and added an additional trill of his own (bar 2). He has used the

rhythm of a quaver followed by two semiquavers at the end of bars 1, 5 and 9 (Oswald has two semiquavers followed by a quaver in each case), and this has the effect of smoothing the melisma (i.e. singing a syllable to several notes) for the singer. The most significant change, though, is in bar 14 with its descending notes F, E, D, C, rather than F, A, D, C in Oswald (if given in the same key). This change has been made to facilitate the voice, and avoids the awkward leap of a sixth from F down to A. It can be deduced from the various changes made here that even though the tune had been recently written by a named composer, Clarke did not think it necessary to stick precisely to the printed tune out of deference to its creator. Rather, flexibility and the ability to vary as necessary were the overriding principles.

Another of Oswald's tunes, 'The Maid's Complaint',⁵⁸ was used in the *Museum* for 'As Sylvia in a forest Lay' (no. 429) (Tune 3). The melody is marked 'Slow' in the original, but no tempo indication is given in the *Museum*. Again, a number of adaptations have been made: the key has been lowered from D minor to B minor in the *Museum*; dotted rhythms have been added by Clarke in bar 9; and an error of 4 semiquavers at the beginning of bar 10 has been made into two sets of quavers in the *Museum*, thus making the note values complete in that bar. Bar 7 has been simplified for singing – the third beat of the bar consisted of a quaver and two semiquavers in Oswald, and the fourth of four running semiquavers. The melody of bar 15 has been altered considerably allowing the tune in the *Museum* to end on B below high C (this would have been the equivalent of a low B in Oswald), thus giving the ending of the song a bolder feel. Other changes of pitch are found in bars 9 and 11. As before, many of these changes have been made to assist the singer, and Clarke clearly felt free to amend Oswald's tune as necessary.

Burns' 'Red, Red Rose' (*Museum*, no. 402) employs the fiddle tune 'Major Graham of Inchbrakie' by Neil Gow (Tune 4).⁵⁹ According to William Stenhouse (1773-1827),⁶⁰ who edited a nineteenth-century edition of the *Museum*,⁶¹ after arranging Burns' words Clarke stated 'in a note written upon the music paper, that "once through the tune takes in all the words, except the last four lines, so that more must be added, or those left out"'.⁶² These last four lines of text are indeed omitted in no. 402 in the *Museum*.⁶³ Clarke follows Gow's tune closely, though the original key is raised from D major to F major in the *Museum*, making the lowest note middle C and thus avoiding ledger lines below this.⁶⁴

Whereas the four songs already considered were set to slow tunes – and were perhaps more straightforward to match to words in that respect – 'Rothemurche's rant' was faster and in strathspey time. This was the tune used for Burns' 'Lassie wi the lintwhite locks'.⁶⁵ Burns

writes of it in a letter to Thomson of September 1794, defending his own use of it, and mentioning the advice that Clarke had given him:

Many of our Strathspeys, ancient & modern, give me most exquisite enjoyment, where you & other judges would ... probably be shewing signs of disgust. – For instance, I am just now making verses for Rothemurche's Rant, an air which puts me in raptures; & in fact, ... unless I be pleased with the tune I never can make verses to it. – Here I have Clarke on my side, who is a judge that I will pit against any of you. – Rothemurche, he says, is an air both original & beautiful; & on his recommendation I have taken the first part of the tune for a chorus, & the fourth or last part for the song. – I am but two stanzas deep in the work, & possibly you may think, & justly, that the poetry is as little worth your attention as the music.⁶⁶

In a letter of 19 November, Burns insists that a chorus is needed and that it should come first in the song.⁶⁷ He also sent Clarke's 'singing set' of the air to Thomson.⁶⁸ Kinsley continues the story:

Burns seems then to have sent the song to Johnson, as he said he would do if Thomson did not like it. ... The Esty MS has instructions to set the chorus to the first part of the air, and the verse to the second or fourth 'as Mr Clarke shall think proper; but in my opinion, the fourth part will suit best'.⁶⁹

In the event, however, Thomson was the one to publish the melody rather than Johnson.

Bremner's *Scots Reels* (1757) provides evidence of 'Rothemurche's Rant' in instrumental tradition.⁷⁰ Here there are indeed four parts demarcated by double-bar lines. Different settings of 'Rothemurche's Rant', however, appear with the song in the work of later editors, e.g. Kinsley, Low, and Dick.⁷¹ All use the first strain as the chorus, although it is only Dick who employs the fourth strain of the instrumental tune for the second part of the song as Burns suggests should be done. When the tune in Thomson's *A Select Collection* is considered, it is evident that the fourth strain is also used for the second part. It is nevertheless interesting that the first two bars of it do not appear anywhere in the instrumental melody as it is given in Bremner. Dick comments that Thomson did print Clarke's tune 'but copied it badly'.⁷² It is likely, however, that the changes that Dick attributed to the copying process were more probably Clarke's own amendments to the

instrumental melody, made in order to fuse the first strain and the fourth strain together. Having ended the first part of the song on the second of the scale (D) – à la Bremner – Clarke decided to take this idea forward, opening the second part on the note of F, suggesting a D minor tonality (which the harmonisations in Thomson support). This, in my view, makes for a more interesting tune, and the version in Thomson is arguably the best available when it comes to performing the song (see Tune 5).

Clarke as a transcriber of tunes

Had Stephen Clarke heard a melody a number of times, he would doubtless have been able to write it down from his own memory. This was almost certainly the method by which many of the tunes made their way into the *Museum*. Like Burns, he also recognised that many instrumental tunes were to be found in the *Companion* and similar books, and as shown above, tunes did indeed make their way into the collection from this source. However, in cases where items were less well-known in oral tradition, or where a singer's version was recognised as being significant in some way, it was necessary for him to transcribe 'from the mouth' of the singer. As an accomplished musician, he would have had no difficulty in writing down melodies in this way.

What has not been appreciated up till now, however, is that in the case of the ballad 'Our Goodman Came Hame at E'en' (*Museum*, no. 454), Clarke effected a descriptive transcription, attempting to show how it was performed (Tune 6). Descriptive transcription is a phenomenon normally associated with the rise of audio technology in the twentieth century, when musicologists had the ability to make recordings of tunes and to play these back repeatedly, and thus describe the details of the performance.⁷³ This meant that ornamentation, changes of time-signature and so on could be captured as a result of numerous listenings, with the recording often being slowed down to facilitate this.⁷⁴ Clarke's transcription, of course, does not equate to some of the very detailed work that has been undertaken in recent decades, but it nevertheless adheres to the principle of trying to capture and convey the detail of a performance.

The fieldwork session at which the ballad was collected is described by Stenhouse. James Johnson's interest had been aroused by seeing the words of this 'extremely curious old ballad' in David Herd's *Ancient and Modern Scottish Songs* of 1776,⁷⁵ and 'considerable efforts' were then undertaken in order to secure the tune. Johnson and Clarke set out together to obtain the tune from a Mr Geikie:

Johnson, the publisher of the *Museum*, after several unavailing searches, was at length informed, that an old man of the name of Geikie, a hair-dresser in the Candlemaker-row, Edinburgh, sung the verses, charmingly, and that the tune was uncommonly fine. Accordingly, he and his friend Mr Clarke took a step to Geikie's lodgings, and invited him to an inn to crack a bottle with them. They soon made him very merry; and on being requested to favour them with the song, he readily complied, and sung it with great glee. Mr Clarke immediately took down the notes, and arranged the song for the *Museum*, in which work the words and music first appeared together in print. Mr Anderson, music engraver in Edinburgh, who served his apprenticeship with Mr Johnson, informs me, that Geikie died about four days after the tune was taken down.⁷⁶

It is rare to have such a detailed account of folk collecting in the late eighteenth century. Here two collectors were involved; they created a convivial atmosphere, which put the informant at his ease; and Clarke, as a trained musician, was able to take the tune down directly from Geikie's performance. There was a sense of importance accorded to obtaining the tune and of good fortune at receiving it just prior to Geikie's death. A John Geikie, barber, who lived above the Crackling House (where tallow was turned into candles), is mentioned in the *Edinburgh Directory* of June 1778 to June 1779,⁷⁷ and is likely to have been the individual in question.⁷⁸

The tune in the *Museum* is the earliest extant for this comic ballad.⁷⁹ It is 40 bars long – most ballad tunes are typically 8 or 16 bars in length – in 2/4 time in A major, and it covers the length of the first verse. The indications of performance include the words 'recit' and 'in time' written above the staff at a number of points, along with many pause marks, these typically occurring at the transition from a 'recit' to an 'in time' passage, and vice versa. These indications reveal that the ballad contained both chanted and sung parts. The word 'recit' is short for recitative, defined by the *Oxford English Dictionary* as 'a style of musical declamation intermediate between singing and ordinary speech, used especially in the dialogue and narrative parts of an opera or oratorio'. Clarke would have been well aware of the term from his keyboard playing. Although pitches are given for the recit, it is significant that only two different notes are used (E and A), with repetition of the tonic note, A, being the dominant feature (and typically restated six times).

It is interesting to note that Geikie's performance style was not unique, with similar instances being found in contemporary and later evidence, demonstrating wide geographical spread and a performance practice which has spanned the centuries. Bronson's variant no. 47,

which appears in the Baring-Gould manuscript, was recorded in July 1793 from Samuel Fone in Devonshire. Although there are no words, above the tune is written ‘recitative’ in one place and ‘sic’ (probably meaning a return to normal) in two other places: in other words, the same kind of performance practice of the ballad was found in England at the time. In twentieth-century performances, spoken lines sometimes occurred, as in the version from Mrs Gillespie (Bronson no. 3) where there is a break in the music to accommodate the spoken lines, e.g. “‘A horse? quo’ she; ‘Ay, a horse,’ quo he.” The characterisation by the performer of the man and woman seems to have been important in order to get the humour across, and perhaps this links with the ‘great glee’ with which Geikie is said to have rendered it. Frequent slowing down then speeding up would certainly capture the listener’s attention.

The words of the first verse in the *Museum* appear to have been drawn from Geikie’s singing and would have been written down by Clarke or possibly Johnson. Table 1 shows the *Museum* and Herd texts side by side for comparison. Significant points of departure are highlighted in the *Museum* text in bold.

<i>Herd, verses 1-4</i>	<i>Museum, verse 1</i>
1. Our goodman came hame at e’en, And hame came he: And there he saw a saddle horse, Where nae horse should be.	1. Our goodman came hame at e’en, And hame came he; And there he saw a saddle-horse, Where nae horse should be.
2. O how came this horse here? How can this be? How came this horse here, Without the leave o’ me?	O how came this horse here? Or how can it be? O how came this horse here, Without the leave o’ me?
3. A horse! quo’ she: Ay, a horse, quo’ he. Ye auld blind dotard carl, Blind mat ye be, ’Tis naething but a bonny milk cow My minny sent to me.	A horse! quo’ she: Ay, a horse, quo’ he. Ye auld blind dotard carl, And blinder mat ye be, ’Tis but a dainty milk cow, My minny sent to me.
4. A bonny milk cow! quo’ he; Ay, a milk cow, quo’ she. Far hae I ridden,	A milk cow! quo’ he; Ay a milk cow, quo’ she. O far hae I ridden,

And meikle hae I seen, But a saddle on a cow's back, Saw I never nane.	And meikle hae I seen, But a saddle on a milk cow afore , I ne'er saw nane.
--	--

Table 1. Comparisons between the opening of 'Our Goodman' in Herd and the *Museum*.

Five further verses are given in the *Museum*, and these follow Herd word for word, except for the following additions in verse 3 that are needed to fit with Geikie's tune: line 3, 'siller' before 'sword'; lines 15-16, 'A parridge spurtle! quo' he:/Ay, a parridge spurtle quo' she'; and line 19, 'parridge' before 'spurtles'. The last two could be added from the context, but 'siller' stands alone and it could have come from a memory of Geikie's version, or it could have been an independent invention.

What survives, then, is Geikie's tune plus what appears to be a verse of his words. The long tune and the long set of words, however, are actually in themselves significant, because this is not a ballad in which the stanzas each have four lines. The rule of thumb is that each verse should open in the same way with the 'our goodman' theme or equivalent, and this is found in other variants in Bronson.⁸⁰ While this piece was entered in J F Child's collection of popular ballads, its structure (i.e. each verse opening the same way), plus the longer length of its verses, makes it more like a folksong than a ballad.

It is likely that Clarke did more collecting from tradition than the records support, and it is possible that he noted down the tunes that he was blamed for losing in the following letter Burns sent to Johnson in spring 1795:

'My lady's gown & gairs upon't' – I think I can yet procure. – 'The Lochmaben harper'
I fear I shall never recover; & it is a famous old song. – The rest are I doubt
irrecoverable. – I think it hard that after so much trouble in gathering these tunes they
should be lost in this trifling way. – Clarke has been shamefully careless.⁸¹

There are five cases in addition to 'Our Goodman', however, where it is known for sure that Clarke transcribed material, and here he was responding to requests by Burns and Johnson. These songs are: 'There was a lass and she was fair'; 'The Wren's Nest'; 'The Grey Goose and the Gled'; 'The Duke of Gordon's Three Daughters'; and 'Ca' the Yowes'.

The tunes of 'There was a lass and she was fair' and 'The Wren's Nest' were sung by Mrs Burns and collected by Clarke during the time he spent in Dumfriesshire as the music

master for the Millers of Dalswinton and the McMurdos of Drumlanrig. The first, for which Burns wrote his song of the same title, which is also known simply as ‘Bonnie Jean’, was addressed to Miss Jean McMurdo. Burns speaks of the tune as ‘a beautiful, simple little Scots air’,⁸² and writes with pleasure about it and his own song to it in a letter to Thomson tentatively dated 2 July 1793:

My dear Sir,

I have just finished the following ballad, & as I do think it in my best style, I send it you. – You had the tune, with a verse or two of the song, from me, a while ago. – Mr Clarke, who wrote down the air from Mrs Burns’s wood-note wild, is very fond of it; & has given it celebrity, by teaching it to some young ladies of the first fashion here.⁸³

The tune as recorded by Clarke has been lost, although he was apparently not to blame for the loss this time as Burns had transmitted it to Thomson. It was listed as ‘untraced’ in Low,⁸⁴ but the tune of a bawdy fragment collected in 1909 from Alexander Robb of New Deer (Aberdeenshire), entitled ‘There Was a Maid and She Was Fair’ and published in the *Greig-Duncan Folk Song Collection*,⁸⁵ seems very likely to be a version of the one that was noted down from Mrs Burns.⁸⁶ Its first two lines are like those of the Burns song and, with its limited range, the air conforms to Burns’ description of it as ‘simple’.

The other tune taken down by Clarke from Mrs Burns, whom we know was a fine singer, was ‘The Wren’s Nest’ (*Museum*, no. 406). He also appears to have taken down its words, which run the length of the tune (Tune 7). Clarke was not terribly complimentary about the music. Stenhouse writes:

Mr Clarke has the following note on his manuscript of the words and music. ‘The tune is only a bad set of Johnny’s Gray Breeks. I took it down from Mrs Burns’ singing. There are more words, I believe. You must apply to Burns.’ But Johnson has written below Mr Clarke’s observation, ‘there are no more words’.⁸⁷

The tempo of the song is described as ‘slowish’. There are two grace notes in bars 5 and 6, respectively, which are likely to be an indication of Mrs Burns’ performance style. The tune has the range of a tenth, and seems fairly elaborate for a vocal melody, more resembling something from the instrumental tradition. It was perhaps this that prompted Clarke’s notion of a ‘bad set’, although he may also have been expressing his disappointment at Mrs Burns

not having something new or unique for ‘The Wren’s Nest’. Clarke must have already dealt with ‘Johnny’s Gray Breeks’ since it appears in the *Museum* as no. 27, set to ‘The Gentle Swain’. At any rate, there are certainly many differences between that tune and Mrs Burns’.

The tune of the ‘Grey Goose’ (*Museum*, no. 405) appears just before ‘The Wren’s Nest’, but in this case there is no evidence of its source. Burns discusses it in a letter to Thomson of September 1794:

Do you know a droll Scots song, more famous for its humour than delicacy, called, The grey goose & the gled? – Mr Clarke took down the notes, such as they are, at my request, which I shall give with some decenter verses to Johnson. – Mr Clarke says the tune is positively an old Chant of the Romish Church; which corroborates [*sic*] the old tradition, that at the Reformation, the Reformers burlesqued much of the old Church Music with setting them to bawdy verse. – As a farther proof, the common name for this song is, Cumnock Psalms.⁸⁸

The chorus is basically a speeded up version of the melody for the verse. Dick comments:

The origin of the tune Cumnock Psalms is obscure. It is framed upon no existing type of Scottish music, and it stands alone. It is chiefly recitative, with only the rudiments of a modern melody and a compass not extending beyond a musical fifth.⁸⁹

He continues: ‘In the whole song and dance music of Scotland, only one melody, called the Cumnock Psalms ... can by any stretch of the imagination have any connection with the church tunes’.⁹⁰ The first verse of the ‘Cumnock Psalms’ (or the ‘Grey Goose’) is shown in Tune 8 with Clarke’s music and the chorus.⁹¹

The tune is set in the *Museum* to Burns’ words for the song ‘A Lassie All Alone’. There are indications above the tune of ‘recitative’ and ‘in time, very Slow’, as well as of pauses to be observed at the end of lines of verse. This is again along the lines of the descriptive transcription that features in ‘Our Goodman’. If this melody was used as a Psalm, as seems likely, Clarke has given an indication of the style of its performance, which being within the everyday knowledge of the congregation would not have been notated in church publications. In terms of the bawdy song, the pauses present in the performance lend themselves particularly to parody, since they could be indefinitely extended. This would likely have been brought out in male convivial settings, possibly with heckling and the raising of a glass. The

impression given of a change of tempo into the chorus given by a greater number of notes in the bars, reflecting the number of syllables, would have again had a parodic or absurd effect. The slowing down of the chorus at the very end, as in the verse, would have brought the tune closer to its 'recitative' tempo that opens the next verse.

In the case of no. 419 in the *Museum*, 'The Duke of Gordon has Three Daughters', Clarke 'took down the air as it was chanted by a lady of his acquaintance'.⁹² This is Child 237, 'The Duke of Gordon's Daughter', and the *Museum* tune (Tune 9) appears first among those recorded in Bronson's collection. The text overall is from Ritson's *Scotish [sic] Songs* (1794),⁹³ although the 'would na' stay' for 'would not stay' in stanza 1 suggests perhaps that this was something that Clarke obtained from a transcription of the sung performance. The *Museum* gives fifteen stanzas of Ritson's text, ending the last stanza with '&c. &c. &c.' to show that the ballad text is incomplete. It seems likely that Clarke was asked to notate a tune for this ballad after it had appeared in Ritson. Some discussion is made by Burns of the fact that the tune of 'Ewe-bughts Marion' was used in the south of Scotland for the ballad,⁹⁴ and the implication is that Clarke's tune was drawn from a lady with connections to the north. He perhaps noted it down from one of the duke of Gordon's daughters during the course of a music lesson.⁹⁵ This is the first tune that we have for the ballad in Scotland. It is unusual in that there are two phrases of six bars each in length. Bronson describes the ballad as being 'anomalous' in terms of the stresses of the syllables.⁹⁶ Like 'Our Goodman', it does not conform to a typical ballad tune.

Burns writes of the song 'Ca the Yowes' (*Museum*, no. 264) in a letter to Thomson of September 1794:

I am flattered at your adopting, 'Ca' the yowes to the knows,' as it was owing to me that ever it saw the light. About seven years ago I was well acquainted with a worthy little fellow of a clergyman, a Mr. Clunzie, who sung it charmingly; and at my request, Mr. Clarke took it down from his singing. When I gave it to Johnson, I added some stanzas to the song, and mended others, but still it will not do for you. In a solitary stroll which I took to-day, I tried my hand on a few pastoral lines, following up the idea of the chorus, which I would preserve. Here it is, with all its crudities and imperfections on its head.⁹⁷

As with Geikie's 'Our Goodman', this song was probably collected at an inn. This, indeed, tended to be the setting for collecting from the male tradition, whereas the home

tended to be where songs from women were gathered. The impression that John Clunie (1757-1819) was a convivial character is given by a thumb-nail sketch in a journal entry made on 23 December 1827 by Walter Scott, who had just attended church in Clunie's former parish:

Went to church to Borthwick ... and heard a well composed, well delivered, sensible discourse from Mr. Wright the clergyman, a different sort of person, I wot, from my old half mad, half drunken little humpback acquaintance Clunie, renowned for singing 'The Auld Mare's Dead' and from the circumstance of his being once interrupted in his minstrelsy by the information that his own horse had died in the stable.⁹⁸

At the time of his meeting with Burns and Clarke, Clunie was about 30 years old. He hailed from Fife and the song 'I lo'e na a laddie but ane'⁹⁹ is ascribed to him.¹⁰⁰ Conolly notes: 'He was educated for the Church of Scotland, and after being licensed to preach the Gospel, he became schoolmaster at Markinch, in Fife; and having an excellent voice, he also acted as precentor'.¹⁰¹

While the song Burns offered to Thomson was an entirely fresh one (apart from the chorus), the one he published in the *Museum* (no. 264) is a pastoral dialogue like his source. Besides small revisions, Burns added two verses of his own and omitted one verse. The traditional version, with its immediate introduction of the dialogue and its close with the promise to marry, is the more coherent song, although Burns' version is the more romantic. Stenhouse's commentary tallies with what Burns said in his letter to Thomson but gives more detailed information, noting the occasion and the words collected.

Mr Stephen Clarke took this song down in 1787, when Burns and he were spending an evening with the Rev. Mr Clunie. Burns, however, added two stanzas to the song, and made several alterations to the old verses, but not in his happiest manner. The old verses follow:

Ca' the yowes to the knowes,
Ca' them where the heather growes,
Ca' them where the burnie rowes,
My bonnie dearie.

Will ye gang down yon water side,
That thro' the glen does saftly glide,
And I sall row thee in my plaid,
My bonnie dearie?
Ca' the yowes, & c.

Ye sall hae rings and ribbons meet,
Calf-leather shoon upon your feet,
And in my bosom ye sall sleep,
My bonnie dearie.
Ca' the yowes, & c.

I was brought up at nae sic school,
My shepherd lad, to play the fool,
Nor sit the livelong day in dool,
Lanely and irie.
Ca' the yowes, &c.

Yon yowes and lammies on the plain,
Wi' a' the gear my dad did hain,
I'se gie thee, if thou'lt be mine ain,
My bonnie dearie.
Ca' the yowes, & c.

Come weel, come wae, whate'er betide,
Gin ye'll prove true, I'se be your bride,
And ye sall row me in your plaid,
My winsome dearie.
Ca' the yowes, & c.

Although the tune is not to be found in any collection prior to 1787, it bears internal marks of antiquity.^[102] It only consists of one strain of eight bars, yet the air is uncommonly wild and pleasing. In the *Museum*, the note C, answering to the first syllable of the word heather, ought to be made sharp.¹⁰³

Caution needs to be taken, of course, in cases like this where the manuscript is unavailable, but it seems about as certain as it is possible to be without contemporary documentation that this is the traditional song that was taken down by Clarke on the evening when he and Burns foregathered with Clunie. It follows that Stenhouse may have had evidence for his comment on the music, and that evidence may have been the music as transcribed from the mouth of the singer found in association with the words he quotes. Kinsley says that ‘there is no authority [in the *Museum*] or in the MS for the practice of singing C# in the fourth bar’,¹⁰⁴ and that is so, but he is implicitly dismissing Stenhouse as a reliable witness on this point. The absence of a sharp can be regarded as a slip which Stenhouse was correcting in his commentary. The sharp is actually added by hand in the reprint of the *Museum* and has clearly been accepted by subsequent musical editors such as Dick and Low.¹⁰⁵

Clarke, as has already been noted, took down the tune along with the traditional words, while the *Museum* has the words as revised by Burns. In the *Museum*, the music is given in full with the chorus and it is indicated that the verse is to the same music but with the variation of the first five notes which appear in smaller print below the chorus (Tune 10). These are also the notes that Burns included with his text of the song (Fig. 5). Clarke’s music (including the C#) is given here in full with the opening of the traditional words.

It is evident, then, that Clarke did undertake fieldwork in order to obtain some of the tunes for the *Museum*. His sources were John Geikie, John Clunie, Mrs Burns, a lady he knew, and an unnamed source.

Conclusion

This article has not only shed light on Clarke in the context of Edinburgh musical society, but also gone some way towards reassessing his contributions to Scottish song. Clarke was a pioneer in descriptive transcription, someone who collected from the field and has contributed to the ways in which the songs of Burns and others are sung today. What we know about the collecting he undertook shows his knowledge of the importance of context, of rapport with informants, and of attentiveness to the details of performance in order to present the song accurately. It was his role in the *Museum* project, and of course the influence of Burns, that led him towards these various activities. Although he certainly lacked dynamism at times, Clarke was nevertheless a pioneer both in transcribing from source singers and in adapting instrumental tunes for voice in the context of eighteenth-century Scots song.

Notes and references

- ¹ Johnson, J and Burns, R. *The Scots Musical Museum*, 6 vols, Edinburgh, 1787-1803. A facsimile reprint of this work is also available: Johnson, J and Burns, R. *The Scots Musical Museum 1787-1803*, 2 vols, intro. D A Low, Aldershot, 1991. For background and context, see Purser, J. *Scotland's Music*, Edinburgh, 1992, chapter XV, 'The Scots Musical Museum 1760-1850'.
- ² For discussion of the different categories of song at this time, see Gelbart, M. *The Invention of 'Folk Music' and 'Art Music': Emerging Categories from Ossian to Wagner*, Cambridge, 2007; and also Mathison, H. Robert Burns and national song. In Duff, D and Jones, C, ed. *Scotland, Ireland and the Romantic Aesthetic*, Lewisburg, 2007, 77-92.
- ³ See Brown, M E. *Burns and Tradition*, Chicago, 1984, for a discussion of Burns' own collecting and use of tradition.
- ⁴ I am very grateful to Dr Emily Lyle, University of Edinburgh, to Professor Carl Lindahl, University of Houston, and to Dr Kirsteen McCue, University of Glasgow, for their kind comments and suggestions in relation to this article.
- ⁵ David Johnson, for example, described Clarke's compositions as 'competent but unimaginative', and his harmonisations in the *Museum* as 'sometimes plain to the point of dullness' (Johnson, D. 'Clarke, Stephen'. In *Grove Music Online*: <http://www.oxfordmusiconline.com/subscriber/article/grove/music/05881> [accessed May 2012]). The musicologist Cedric Thorpe Davie stated that the harmonisations were 'at best undistinguished and at worst barely competent' (Davie, C T. Robert Burns, writer of songs. In Low, D A, ed. *Critical Essays on Robert Burns*, London, 1975, 157-85, 163). It is obvious, however, that with 500 tunes to work with, only fairly limited attention could be given to each one by Clarke: in other words, the practicalities perhaps outweighed the musical aesthetic.
- ⁶ Roy, G R, ed. *The Letters of Robert Burns*, 2nd edn, 2 vols, Oxford, 1985, II, letter 504.
- ⁷ See the letter from Burns to Thomson (Roy, 1985, II, letter 676) and the letter from Thomson to Burns, 3 August 1795 (*The Works of Robert Burns; With An Account of His Life*, 4th edn, 4 vols, London, 1802-3, IV, letter 77).
- ⁸ See the aforementioned letter of 3 August 1795, and the letter from Burns to the Reverend John Skinner (Roy, 1985, I, letter 147).
- ⁹ See McGuinness, D. Tune accompaniments in eighteenth-century Scottish music publications. In Munro, G, et al., eds. *Notis Musycall: Essays on Music and Scottish Culture in Honour of Kenneth Elliott*, Glasgow, 2005, 221-9.
- ¹⁰ Volume 6 of the *Museum*, the work of William Clarke, includes no figured bass.

-
- ¹¹ Thomson, G. *A Select Collection of Original Scottish Airs for the Voice*, 6 vols, Edinburgh and London, 1793-1841, I, 1.
- ¹² Clarke died in Edinburgh on 9 August 1797 aged fifty-three years; the cause of death is given as 'bowel complaint' (Old Parish Registers [OPR], 692/02 0310 0156, death record, Leith South, 9 August 1797). Clarke's death notice appeared in newspapers of the time, e.g. the *Bath Chronicle and Weekly Gazette*, 17 August 1797, 3. See also Baptie, D. *Musical Scotland: Past and Present*, Paisley, 1894, 31.
- ¹³ Roy, 1985, I, letter 147.
- ¹⁴ Baptie, 1894, 31.
- ¹⁵ OPR, 685/01 0490 0277, marriage record, Edinburgh, 22 September 1765.
- ¹⁶ McElroy, D D. *Scotland's Age of Improvement: A Survey of Eighteenth-Century Literary Clubs and Societies*, Washington, 1969, 147.
- ¹⁷ Brown, R. *Robert Fergusson and the Scottish Periodical Press*, Farnham, Surrey, 2012.
- ¹⁸ Hecht, H, ed. *Songs from David Herd's Manuscripts*, Edinburgh, 1904, 35-45.
- ¹⁹ Hecht, 1904, 36-7.
- ²⁰ McElroy, 1969, 146.
- ²¹ National Library of Scotland [NLS], MS. 2004, Cape Club Sederunt Book, 1764-1787, 15.
- ²² NLS, MS. 2004, Cape Club Sederunt Book, 1764-1787, 58-9.
- ²³ See Johnson, D. *Music and Society in Lowland Scotland in the Eighteenth Century*, London, 1972; Harris, D F. *Saint Cecilia's Hall in the Niddry Wynd*, Edinburgh, 1899.
- ²⁴ See Burchell, J. *Polite or Commercial Concerts?: Concert Management and Orchestral Repertoire in Edinburgh, Bath, Oxford, Manchester, and Newcastle, 1730-1799*, London, 1996.
- ²⁵ Watkinson, C D. 'Ebdon, Thomas (bap. 1738, d. 1811)'. In *Oxford Dictionary of National Biography*, Oxford, 2004 [hereafter *ODNB*]; online edn, 2008: <http://www.oxforddnb.com/view/article/8428> [accessed June 2012].
- ²⁶ National Records of Scotland [NRS], GD113/4/164/104, Letter from Gilbert Innes to Thomas Ebdon at Durham, 9 January 1790.
- ²⁷ NRS, GD113/4/159/97, Letter from Thomas Ebdon, Durham, to Gilbert Innes, 24 St Andrew Square, Edinburgh, 18 January 1790.

-
- ²⁸ Stewart, D A. *An Interim List of Scottish Organs (Excluding Edinburgh) Summarised from the Research Papers of the Late Godfrey I. Burgess Winn*, Edinburgh, 1985.
- ²⁹ NLS, MS. Dep.361, 27a, Winn Papers, 66-7.
- ³⁰ Johnson, 1972, 53.
- ³¹ For a history of the chapel, see Bertie, D M. *Scottish Episcopal Clergy, 1689-2000*, Edinburgh, 2000, 574.
- ³² Harris, 1899, 100.
- ³³ Bertie, 2000, 574.
- ³⁴ Edinburgh City Archives, ED002/1/1, Minute book of Old St Paul's. I am grateful to Stuart Donald, Aberdeen, and to Richard Hunter of Edinburgh City Archives for assisting with my enquiries in connection with St Paul's.
- ³⁵ Both Stephen and William Clarke are discussed in the papers of Colonel Godfrey Burgess Winn (NLS, MS. Dep.361, 27a). I would like to thank Mr A C Stuart Donald, Keeper of the Aberdeen Diocesan Library and Honorary Archivist, for his assistance with my enquiries relating to Stephen Clarke and specifically for introducing me to the papers of the Winn collection. Winn gives various addresses for Clarke noting that he is listed in the *Edinburgh Directory* for 1778-9 at Blackfriars' Wynd as an organist, and then as a 'musician' at Merlin's Wynd (1780-3), Chalmers' Close (1784-5), Gosford's Close (1786-8), 1 Canal Street (1788-9) and then at Broughton (1790-2).
- ³⁶ NRS, GD44/51/408/6, Papers of the Gordon Family, Dukes of Gordon, 'State of Cash Debursed by Dowager Lady Maxwell, on acct. of the Duke of Gordon Young Ladies Governess and Servant, presently residing in her Ladyships family', 12 November 1787, entry 14.
- ³⁷ Their dates were: Charlotte (1768-1842), Madeline (d. 1847), Susan (1774-1828), Louisa (1776-1850) and Georgiana (1781-1853).
- ³⁸ Lodge, C. 'Gordon, Jane, duchess of Gordon (1748/9-1812)'. In *ODNB*; online edn, 2007: <http://www.oxforddnb.com/view/article/11059> [accessed June 2012].
- ³⁹ Roy, 1985, I, letter 61a (to Dr John Mackenzie) and letter 64 (to Mr Robert Muir). Burns visited the duchess at Gordon Castle, Fochabers, on his Highland tour in September 1787.
- ⁴⁰ Roy, 1985, I, letter 147 (to Reverend John Skinner at Longside, October 1787).
- ⁴¹ Information from Robert L D Cooper, Curator of the Grand Lodge Scotland.
- ⁴² Campbell, K. Masonic song in Scotland: folk tunes and community, *Oral Tradition*, (2012, forthcoming); Campbell, K. The Masons' Walk at Rosehearty, *Review of Scottish Culture*, 20 (2008), 127-32.

-
- ⁴³ The portrait was given to the Grand Lodge in 1862.
- ⁴⁴ Marshall, J. *A Winter with Robert Burns* (1846), ed. R L D Cooper, Helensburgh, 2002.
- ⁴⁵ Marshall, 2002, v.
- ⁴⁶ Marshall, 2002, 167.
- ⁴⁷ Roy, 1985, I, letter 348.
- ⁴⁸ Roy, 1985, II, letter 591.
- ⁴⁹ Chambers, R, ed. *The Life and Works of Robert Burns*, 4 vols, Edinburgh, 1896, IV, 88-9.
- ⁵⁰ Ericson-Roos, C. *The Songs of Robert Burns*, Stockholm, 1977, 16.
- ⁵¹ Campbell, K and McCue, K. Song culture in the long eighteenth-century. In Dunnigan, S and Gilbert, S, eds. *Scottish Traditional Literatures*, Edinburgh, forthcoming.
- ⁵² Oswald, J. *The Caledonian Pocket Companion*, 12 vols, London, c.1745-c.1760 [hereafter *Companion*]. A modern edition with introduction and notes is available on CD ROM: *The Caledonian Pocket Companion by James Oswald, Books 1-6*, ed. J Purser, with N Parkes, CD ROM, 2006; *The Caledonian Pocket Companion by James Oswald, Books 7-12*, ed. J Purser, with N Parkes, CD ROM, 2007.
- ⁵³ Roy, 1985, II, letter 452.
- ⁵⁴ Anderson, J. *Collection of New Highland Strathspey Reels for the Violin or German Flute*, Edinburgh, c.1795.
- ⁵⁵ I am grateful to Dr Kenneth Dunn of the National Library of Scotland for his help with my enquiries relating to Burns. The annotated copy is held in the Robert Burns Birthplace Museum, Alloway. See also Dick, J C, ed. *Notes on Scottish Song*, London, 1908.
- ⁵⁶ *Companion*, XII, 1.
- ⁵⁷ *Companion*, I, 13; Stenhouse, W. *Illustrations of the Lyric Poetry and Music of Scotland*, Edinburgh, 1853a, 201, identifies Oswald as the composer of it.
- ⁵⁸ *Companion*, IV, 30; Glen, J. *Early Scottish Melodies*, Edinburgh, 1900, 194; Stenhouse, 1853a, 381.
- ⁵⁹ See this tune, for example, in Gow, N. *A New Edition Corrected of Strathspey Reels with a Bass for the Violoncello or Harpsichord*, Edinburgh, c.1805, 6 (NLS Glen 294.2). The tune that is normally used for 'Red, Red Rose' in modern-day performance is 'Low Down in the Broom' (Kinsley, J, ed. *The Poems and Songs of Robert Burns*, 3 vols, Oxford, 1968, III, 1456).

- ⁶⁰ See Hadden, J C. 'Stenhouse, William (1773-1827)', rev. J Purser. In *ODNB*; online edn: <http://www.oxforddnb.com/view/article/26359> [accessed June 2012]. See also McAulay, K E. 'Our ancient national airs: Scottish song collecting c.1760-1888', PhD thesis, University of Glasgow, 2009, chapter 5.
- ⁶¹ See Stenhouse, 1853a; Stenhouse, W. '*The Scots Musical Museum*' ... now accompanied with copious notes and illustrations to the lyric Poetry and Music of Scotland by the late William Stenhouse with additional notes and illustrations, 4 vols, Edinburgh and London, 1853b.
- ⁶² Stenhouse, 1853a, 351. It should be noted that Clarke does not include the repeat at the end of the first eight bars found in Gow's tune.
- ⁶³ The words do, however, appear in the *Museum* entitled 'Old Set, – Red Red Rose' (Johnson and Burns, 1787-1803, V, no. 403), though not with the traditional tune of the song (Kinsley, 1968, III, 1456).
- ⁶⁴ See further McCue, K C. 'O My Luve's Like a Red, Red, Rose': does Burns's melody really matter?. In Scott, P and Simpson, K, eds. *Robert Burns and Friends*, Columbia, South Carolina, 2012, 68-82.
- ⁶⁵ See Thomson, III, no. 121.
- ⁶⁶ Roy, 1985, II, letter 637.
- ⁶⁷ Roy, 1985, II, letter 647.
- ⁶⁸ Roy, 1985, II, letter 646.
- ⁶⁹ Kinsley, 1968, III, 1461.
- ⁷⁰ Bremner, R. *A Collection of Scots Reels*, London, 1757, 42.
- ⁷¹ See Kinsley, 1968, no. 466; Low, D A, ed. *The Songs of Robert Burns*, London, 1993, no. 268; Dick, J C. *The Songs of Robert Burns*, London, 1903, no. 103.
- ⁷² Dick, 1903, 385.
- ⁷³ Seeger, C. Prescriptive and descriptive music-writing, *The Musical Quarterly*, 44:2 (1958), 184-95.
- ⁷⁴ See discussion by Ellingson, T. Transcription. In Myers, H, ed. *Ethnomusicology: An Introduction*, London, 1992, 110-52.
- ⁷⁵ Herd, D. *Ancient and Modern Scottish Songs, Heroic Ballads, etc.*, 2 vols, Edinburgh, 1776, II, 172-5.
- ⁷⁶ Stenhouse, 1853a, 401-2. Although Stenhouse does not give a specific source for his material, the reference to Anderson at the end is to John Anderson, music engraver,

Edinburgh, who was indeed apprenticed to James Johnson (see the NLS online Scottish Book Trade Index: <http://www.nls.uk/catalogues/scottish-book-trade-index/allan-armour> [accessed February 2013]). It is likely that this memorable story came down via oral tradition from Anderson, to Johnson, then to Stenhouse.

- ⁷⁷ *Williamson's Directory for the City of Edinburgh, from June 1778 to June 1779*, Edinburgh, 1778, 39.
- ⁷⁸ The directories are not always complete in their coverage. A John Geikie, hairdresser, is listed in subsequent directories, but his address is given as Potter Row rather than as Candlemaker Row.
- ⁷⁹ Child, F J, ed. *The English and Scottish Popular Ballads*, 5 vols, Boston, 1882-98, V, no. 274, 'Our Goodman'.
- ⁸⁰ Bronson, B H. *The Traditional Tunes of the Child Ballads*, 4 vols, Princeton, 1959-72, IV, no. 274; see for example variants 3 and 5. The opening of 'Our goodman came hame at e'en' happens a total of five times in the *Museum* version with only the last verse varying with 'Ben went our goodman', signalling the end of the ballad. In Mrs Gillespie's version of the ballad (Bronson, 1959-72, IV, 99, no. 3), which came from Aberdeenshire tradition, there are again six long verses, all of which open 'Hame cam oor goodman, an' hame cam he'. In Bronson (1959-72, IV, 114-15, no. 32; entitled 'Six Nights Drunk' – a common title for the ballad in North American tradition), there are also six verses, each opening effectively the same way, but counting upwards from the first night the man comes home to the sixth night.
- ⁸¹ Roy, 1985, II, letter 667.
- ⁸² Roy, 1985, II, letter 571.
- ⁸³ Roy, 1985, II, letter 568.
- ⁸⁴ Low, 1993, no. 238.
- ⁸⁵ Shuldham-Shaw, P, *et al.*, eds. *The Greig-Duncan Folk Song Collection*, 8 vols, Aberdeen and Edinburgh, 1981-2002, VII, no. 1335.
- ⁸⁶ See further Campbell, K and Lyle, E. *Burns and Scottish Fiddle Tradition*, Edinburgh, 2000.
- ⁸⁷ Stenhouse, 1853a, 365.
- ⁸⁸ Roy, 1985, II, letter 637.
- ⁸⁹ Dick, 1903, 453.
- ⁹⁰ Dick, 1903, 425.
- ⁹¹ Roy, 1985, II, letter 637.

- ⁹² Stenhouse, 1853a, 378.
- ⁹³ Ritson, J. *Scottish Songs*, 2 vols, London, 1794, II, 169-75.
- ⁹⁴ See Bronson, 1959-72, III, 407.
- ⁹⁵ The song-collector, William Christie (1817-85), a dean in the Episcopal Church who lived in Fochabers and was strongly connected with the Gordon family at Gordon Castle there, collected two tunes for this ballad, a 'major set' and a 'minor set', the first coming from a man in the Fochabers area. See Christie, W. *Traditional Ballad Airs*, 2 vols, Edinburgh, 1876-81, I, 2, 4.
- ⁹⁶ Bronson, 1959-72, III, 407.
- ⁹⁷ Roy, 1985, II, letter 636.
- ⁹⁸ Anderson, W E K, ed. *The Journal of Sir Walter Scott*, Edinburgh, 1998, 453.
- ⁹⁹ Johnson and Burns, 1787-1803, III, no. 267.
- ¹⁰⁰ Conolly, M. *Biographical Dictionary of Eminent Men of Fife*, Cupar, 1866, 125.
- ¹⁰¹ He was ordained minister of the parish of Borthwick, Midlothian, c.1790 and died in 1819 (Conolly, 1866, 125).
- ¹⁰² A possible Isobel Pagan context for this song is discussed by McCue, K C. Burns, women and song. In Crawford, R, ed. *Robert Burns and Cultural Authority*, Edinburgh, 1997, 40-57.
- ¹⁰³ Stenhouse, 1853a, 248-9. See also Henderson, T F. 'Clunie, John (c.1757-1819)', rev. J How. In *ODNB*; online edn: <http://www.oxforddnb.com/view/article/5724> [accessed June 2012]. Henderson describes Burns and Clarke as spending a night with Clunie, but this was a probable misunderstanding based on 'the evening' mentioned in Stenhouse.
- ¹⁰⁴ Kinsley, 1968, III, 1252.
- ¹⁰⁵ Dick, 1903, no. 195. Low also adds C# to the key signature (Low, 1993, nos. 64 and 260).